

1 TODD KIM

2 Assistant Attorney General

3 LUCY E. BROWN (HI Bar No. 10946)

4 *Attorney*

5 United States Department of Justice

6 Environment & Natural Resources Division

7 Environmental Defense Section

8 4 Constitution Square

9 150 M St., N.E.

10 Suite 4.400

11 Washington D.C. 20002

12 Telephone (202) 598-1868

13 Facsimile (202) 514-8865

14 Email: lucy.e.brown@usdoj.gov

15 *Attorneys for Defendant*

16 [additional counsel listed in signature block]

17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION**

CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY

*et al.,*

Plaintiffs,

v.

MICHAEL S. REGAN, in his official capacity  
as the Administrator of the United States  
Environmental Protection Agency,

Defendant.

Case No. 3:20-cv-05436-EMC

**JOINT NOTICE TO COURT OF  
STIPULATION TO MODIFY CONSENT  
DECREE (DKT. NO. 44)**

Defendant Michael S. Regan, in his official capacity as the Administrator of the United States Environmental Protection Agency (hereinafter “EPA”), and Plaintiffs Center for Biological Diversity, Center for Environmental Health, and Sierra Club (collectively, “Plaintiffs”) file this stipulation notifying the Court that the parties have agreed to extend the deadlines for final action to determine whether Muscatine, Iowa and St. Bernard Parish, Louisiana have attained the 2010 sulfur dioxide National Ambient Air Quality Standards (“SO<sub>2</sub> NAAQS”) by the attainment date. The aforementioned deadline is set forth in Paragraph 1.b. of

1 the Consent Decree entered by the Court on June 25, 2021 (Dkt. No. 44). Paragraph 5 of the  
2 Consent Decree provides, inter alia, that “[t]he deadlines established by this Consent Decree may  
3 be extended (a) by written stipulation of Plaintiffs and EPA with notice to the Court . . . .”  
4 Consent Decree, ¶ 5;

5 WHEREAS, the Consent Decree provides that, no later than March 31, 2022, the  
6 appropriate EPA official shall “sign a notice of final rulemaking pursuant to CAA section  
7 179(c), 42 U.S.C. § 7509(c), determining whether [Muscatine, Iowa and St. Bernard Parish,  
8 Louisiana] attained the 2010 SO<sub>2</sub> NAAQs by the attainment date, i.e. April 4, 2019[.]” Consent  
9 Decree, ¶ 1.b.;

10 WHEREAS, EPA needs additional time in light of factual developments that have  
11 occurred since entry of the Consent Decree to sign notices of final rulemaking determining  
12 whether Muscatine, Iowa and St. Bernard Parish, Louisiana attained the 2010 SO<sub>2</sub> NAAQs by  
13 the attainment date;

14 WHEREAS, the parties have agreed to an extension of the action for Muscatine, Iowa in  
15 Paragraph 1.b. from March 31, 2022 to June 30, 2022; and

16 WHEREAS, the parties have agreed to an extension of the action for St. Bernard Parish,  
17 Louisiana in Paragraph 1.b. from March 31, 2022 to September 30, 2022.

18 NOW THEREFORE, Plaintiffs and EPA hereby stipulate as follows:

19 1. EPA’s deadline to perform the action described in Paragraph 1.b. of the Consent  
20 Decree with regard to Muscatine, Iowa (Dkt. No. 44, ¶ 1.b.) is extended to June 30, 2022.

21 2. EPA’s deadline to perform the action described in Paragraph 1.b. of the Consent  
22 Decree with regard to St. Bernard Parish, Louisiana (Dkt. No. 44, ¶ 1.b.) is extended to  
23 September 30, 2022.

24 //

25 //

26 //

27 //

28 //

1 Respectfully submitted,

2 Date: February 8, 2022

3 /s Robert Ukeiley (email auth. 2/7/22)

4 ROBERT UKEILEY, Admitted *Pro Hac Vice*  
5 CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY  
6 1536 Wynkoop St., Ste. 421  
7 Denver, CO 80202  
8 Tel: (720) 496-8568  
9 Email: rukeiley@biologicaldiversity.org

10 Jonathan Evans (Cal. Bar #247376)  
11 CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY  
12 1212 Broadway, Suite 800  
13 Oakland, CA 94612  
14 Tel: 510-844-7100 x318  
15 Fax: 510-844-7150  
16 Email: jevans@biologicaldiversity.org

17 *Counsel for Plaintiffs*

18  
19 TODD KIM  
20 Assistant Attorney General

21 /s Lucy E. Brown

22 LUCY E. BROWN (HI Bar No. 10946)  
23 U.S. Department of Justice  
24 Environment & Natural Resources Division  
25 Environmental Defense Section  
26 4 Constitution Square  
27 150 M St., N.E.  
28 Suite 4.400  
Washington D.C. 20002  
Tel: (202) 598-1868  
Email: lucy.e.brown@usdoj.gov

*Attorneys for Defendant*

25 Of counsel:  
26 Hali Kerr  
27 Office of General Counsel  
28 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency